The Literacy Design Collaborative Argumentation Module

Using Literature to Analyze Choice and Consequences!

Lauren Chuk, Doreen Genna, Kenneth Kozberg,

Christine LaBonte, Caryn McCrohon,

Kara Scichilone, Jodi Towne

Worcester Public Schools

Information Sheet

Module Title: Using literature to analyze choice and consequences!	

Module Description (overview): This unit of study will allow students to use various genres of literature to analyze the choices characters make and identify the consequences of those choices.

Task 2 Argumentative/Evaluation LI (Insert essential question) After reading (literature or informational text) ______, write an _____ (essay or substitute) that ______ (content) and support your position with evidence from text(s). What are the consequences of choices that are made? After reading On My Honor, Tuck Everlasting or The Skin I'm In, The Lady in the Box, Breaking Point, The Secret Soldier write an essay that addresses the question and support your position with evidence from text(s). L2 Be sure to acknowledge competing views. L3 Give examples from past or current events or issues to illustrate and clarify your position.

Grade(s)/Level: Grade 6

Discipline: ELA

Course:

Author(s): Lauren Chuk, Doreen Genna, Kenneth Kozberg, Christine LaBonte, Caryn McCrohon, Kara

Scichilone, Jodi Towne

Contact information: scichilonek@worc.k12.ma.us and mccrohonc@worc.k12.ma.us

Section 1: What Task?

What task sets clear, measurable goals for learning?

A. Template task (include number, type, level): Insert the Argumentation template task you selected exactly as it is worded.

Task 2 Argumentative/Evaluation LI
(Insert essential question) After reading (literature or informational text), write an
(essay or substitute) that (content) and support your position with evidence
from text(s). L2 Be sure to acknowledge competing views. L3 Give examples from past or current
events or issues to illustrate and clarify your position.

B. Standards: The CCR Anchor Standards from the common core standards are already identified by the Literacy Design Collaborative for all Argumentation tasks.

Number	CCR Anchor Standards for Reading (Argumentation)	
I	Read closely to determine what the text says explicitly and to make logical inferences from it; cite specific textual evidence when writing or speaking to support conclusions drawn from the text.	
3	Analyze how and why individuals, events, and ideas develop and interact over the course of a text.	
8	Delineate and evaluate the argument and specific claims in a text, including the validity of the reasoning as well as the relevance and sufficiency of the evidence.	
9	Analyze how two or more texts address similar themes or topics in order to build knowledge or to compare the approaches the authors take.	
10	Read and comprehend complex literary and informational texts independently and proficiently. CCR Anchor Standards for Writing (Argumentation)	
Number		
I	Write arguments to support claims in an analysis of substantive topics or texts, using valid reasoning and relevant and sufficient evidence.	
4	Produce clear and coherent writing in which the development, organization, and style are appropriate to task, purpose, and audience.	
9 Draw evidence from literary or informational texts to support analysis, r research.		
10	Write routinely over extended time frames (time for research, reflection, and revision) and shorter time frames (a single sitting or a day or two) for a range of tasks, purposes, and audience.	

Content Standards Source: : Massachusetts ELA Curriculum Frameworks

Number	Content Standard(s)	
MA 22.7	Use additional knowledge of correct mechanics (apostrophes, quotation marks, comma use in compound sentences, paragraph indentations), correct sentence structure (elimination of fragments and run-ons), and correct standard English spelling (commonly used homophones) when writing, revising, and editing.	
MA 19.22	Write and justify a personal interpretation of literary, informational, or expository reading that includes a topic statement, supporting details from the literature, and a conclusion.	
MA 19.23	Write multi-paragraph compositions that have clear topic development, logical organization, effective use of detail, and variety in sentence structure.	

Teaching Task: Design your teaching task.

Background:

Groups and individuals make choices on a daily basis. For example, citizens choose their lawmakers and students choose their friends; every choice carries a consequence. Through reading literature that highlights characters that have to make choices, students can analyze the consequences of those choices.

Prompt:

What are the consequences of choices that are made? After reading a novel or other related texts write an essay that addresses the question and support your position with evidence from text(s). L2 Be sure to acknowledge competing views. L3 Give examples from past or current events or issues to illustrate and clarify your position.

Extension (optional):

Students will write an essay that describes a consequence of one of their own choices or actions. If given another opportunity, what choice would you make?

LDC Argumentation Rubric for Teaching Task ADVANCED		
Γ		
Focus Addresses all aspects of the prompt with a highly focused and convincing respons		
Reading/Research Demonstrates accurate and effective use of reading materials to develop argument proposal and a solid understanding of content as presented in the prompt.		
Controlling Idea	Establishes a substantive and credible claim or proposal (L2) Acknowledges relevant competing arguments, defending or qualifying the claim or proposal as appropriate.	
Development	Develops a detailed and convincing argument or proposal; provides relevant evidence in the form of examples or explanations with statements from reading material. (L3) Makes a clarifying connection(s) that illuminates argument and adds depth to reasoning.	
Organization	such as deductive reasoning.	
Conventions	Demonstrates a well-developed command of standard English conventions and cohesion; employs language and tone appropriate to audience and purpose.	
	MEETS EXPECTATIONS	
Focus	Addresses the prompt and stays on task; provides a generally convincing response.	
Reading/Research	Demonstrates generally effective use of reading materials to develop argument or proposal and an understanding of the content as presented in the prompt.	
Controlling Idea	Establishes a credible claim or proposal (L2) Acknowledges competing arguments while defending the claim or proposal.	
Development	Develops a satisfactory argument or proposal using reasoning with adequate detail to support claim or proposal; provides evidence from text(s) in the form of examples or explanations relevant to the argument or proposal. (L3) Makes a relevant connection that helps to clarify argument or proposal.	
Organization	Applies an appropriate text structure that develops reasoning; applies a logic model.	
Conventions	Demonstrates a satisfactory command of standard English conventions and cohesion; employs language and tone appropriate to audience and purpose.	
	NOT YET	
Focus	Attempts to address prompt but lacks focus or is off-task.	
Reading/Research	Demonstrates weak use of reading materials to develop argument or proposal.	
Controlling Idea	Establishes a claim or proposal but is weak or off task; (L2) Attempts to acknowledge competing arguments.	
Development	Lacks details to support reasoning; examples or explanations are weak or not relevant. (L3) Connection is not relevant.	
Organization	Provides a weak text structure; composition is confusing.	
Conventions	Demonstrates a weak command of standard English conventions; lacks cohesion; language and tone are not appropriate to audience and purpose.	

Section 2: What Skills?

What skills do students need to succeed on the teaching task?

Each module is required to identify the specific student skills, define them, and cluster them. The prototype below shows one way to do that. Module builders can use this version, change it, or create a different skill list, different definitions, and different clusters using the chart.

LDC Example Skills List		
Specific Skills What skills are essential?	Student Skills Defined ("Ability to…") How do you define/describe those skills?	
Skills Cluster I: Preparing for the Task		
I. Bridging Conversation	Ability to connect the task and new content to existing knowledge, skills, experiences, interests, and concerns.	
2. Task analysis	Ability to understand and explain the task's prompt and rubric.	
3. Project planning	Ability to plan so that the task is accomplished on time.	
Skills Cluster 2: Reading Pr	ocess	
I. Reading "habits of mind"	Ability to select appropriate texts and understand necessary reading strategies needed for the task.	
2. Essential vocabulary	Ability to apply strategies for developing an understanding of a text by locating words and phrases that identify key concepts and facts, or information.	
3. Note-taking	Ability to read purposefully and select relevant information; to summarize and/or paraphrase.	
4. Organizing notes	Ability to prioritize and narrow supporting information.	
Skills Cluster 3: Transition	to Writing	
I. Bridging Conversation	Ability to transition from reading or researching phase to the writing phase.	
Skills Cluster 4: Writing Pr	ocess	
I. Initiation of task	Ability to establish a claim and consolidate information relevant to task.	
2. Planning	Ability to develop a line of thought and text structure appropriate to an argumentation task.	
3. Development	Ability to construct an initial draft with an emerging line of thought and structure.	
4. Revision	Ability to apply revision strategies to refine development of argument, including line of thought, language usage, and tone as appropriate to audience and purpose.	
5. Editing	Ability to apply editing strategies and presentation applications.	

Section 3: What Instruction?

How will teachers teach students to succeed on the teaching task?

The following is an LDC example instructional ladder to be adopted, adapted or deleted by the module developers to build their own. This is <u>one</u> example of an instructional ladder. Just delete the language and use the chart to create your own instructional ladder specific to the skills you have identified in Section 2.

Skills Cluster 1: Preparing for the Task

Optional Pre-test: Students will read independently the short story, "Thank you, M'am" and respond to the task for the pre-test.

I. Bridging conversation: Ability to connect the task and new content to existing knowledge, skills, experiences, interests, and concerns.

Mini-task

- Prompt: Brainstorm as a whole group, "What is a consequence?"
- Product: Word Splash/Graffiti Board
- Mini-task scoring: No scoring

Instructional strategies/ notes

- Teach the necessary vocabulary for comprehension of the essential question consequences, choices, risk, reward, affect vs. effect, ramification
- Use vocabulary map/graphic organizer to illustrate new vocabulary (to include such categories as definition, illustration, synonym, antonym, etc.)

Pacing: 60mins

PD/ preparation

- Discuss in detail the reading strategies that apply to the task
- Do the task to ensure understanding of the demands and cognitive processes in it.
- Create a template for students to use during the writing process.
- 2. **Task analysis:** Ability to understand and explain the task's prompt and rubric.

#1 Mini-task

- Prompt: In your own words, write a brief explanation of what the task is asking you to do.
- Product: Short response
- Mini-task scoring: No scoring

Instructional strategies/ notes

- Use think-pair-share strategy to ensure all students understand the task
- Review each student's response to ensure she/he understands the task.
- Discuss in detail the prompt, type of writing and structure, the product, and the rubric.

Pacing: 30 mins

PD/ preparation

• Collaboratively plan the task: e.g. How much time to teach each step? How much time to score? How to conduct scoring? Do we need any training on specific aspects of the task? Who has the expertise?

#2 Mini-task

- *Prompt*: Compare and contrast the LDC rubric and the RRJ rubric. Look for evidence of the RRJ rubric elements in the LDC rubric. Use different color highlighters to highlight the evidence.
- Product: Highlighted Rubric
- Mini-task scoring: No scoring

Instructional strategies/ notes

- Lead discussion for students, model highlighting of evidence of RRI rubric in the LDC rubric.
- Have students work in partners to check for understanding
- Whole group discussion to share evidence
- Discuss similar vocabulary terms used in the rubrics (e.g., Development = with evidence)

Pacing: I day

PD/ preparation

- Create exemplars of elements of rubric
- Review all components of LDC rubric
- 3. Project planning: Ability to plan so that the task is accomplished on time.

Mini-task

- Prompt: Three weeks from today, you will begin to write an essay that addresses the essential question.

 Create a project timeline to map out your reading assignments in order for you to complete the novel by the start of the writing process
- **Product:** Timeline
- Mini-task scoring guide

Meets	Not yet
1 0 01	Attempts to meet the criteria for "meets"

Instructional strategies/ notes

- Model a common or sample timeline & homework.
- Provide students with a timeline template.
- Discuss the importance of planning.
- Teacher may create timeline for differentiation purposes

Pacing: I hour

PD/ preparation

 Create sample timelines, homework, timeline template and other appropriate tools to support student planning.

Skills Cluster 2: Reading Process

1. **Reading "habits of mind":** Ability to select appropriate texts and understand necessary reading strategies needed for the task.

#1 Mini-task

- Prompt: Interactive read aloud, Butterfly, complete Reader's Response Journal entry
- *Product:* friendly letters
- Mini-task scoring guide RRJ Rubric informal*

Instructional strategies/ notes

- Plan for reading <u>Butterfly</u>, Day I read aloud for pleasure, Day 2 interactive read aloud (teach vocabulary, stop and ask comprehension questions, Day 3 introduce questions for response and read aloud, then students begin letter, Day 3-5 Student write in RRJ and teacher responds back and students respond back
- Questions for Reader's Response Journal entry What choice(s) did the character have to face? What were the consequences of those choices? Would you have made the same choice?
- Teacher will respond back to student in letter format with questions to move student comprehension to next level according to RRJ rubric (created by Goddard School)

Pacing: I week

PD/ preparation

- Determine vocabulary to teach during read aloud and identify reading strategies for students to use during read aloud and during independent reading.
- Plan for students who need extra time, resources, or assistance.

#2 Mini-task

- Prompt: When you meet with your reading group discuss the essential question as it relates to the story
- Product: Discussions and comprehension of text
- Mini-task scoring guide

Meets	Not yet
Student completes reading assignments for the book based on their lexile scores. Student completes all tasks and prepares for group discussions.	Attempts to meet the criteria for "meets"

Instructional strategies/ notes

- Students will participate in literature circles to read and discuss common book according to their lexile levels. On My Honor, Tuck Everlasting, The Skin I'm In, The Lady in the Box, Breaking Point, The Secret Soldier
- Students will complete assigned readings and participate in group discussions around the book in order for further comprehension of text
- Use discourse strategy prolonged discussion around book and essential questions

Pacing: Throughout 2-3 weeks

PD/ preparation

- Teacher will group students based on data and assign appropriate text
- Teacher will differentiate instruction based on lexile levels (support students at their instructional reading level read with partner, listen to book on tape)
- 2. **Essential vocabulary:** Ability to apply strategies for developing an understanding of a text(s) by locating words and phrases that identify key concepts and facts, or information.

Mini-task

- Prompt: In your bluebook, identify key words or phrases as you read, noting those that you think a 5th grader couldn't define using comprehension strategies from class such as using context clues
- *Product*: Vocabulary notebook entries

Mini-task scoring guide

	Meets	Not yet
•	Identifies vocabulary, phrases and notes their denotative (explicit)	Attempts to meet the criteria
	meaning and, if applicable, their meaning in context of the	for "meets"
	passage(s).	
•	Writes in readable prose.	

Instructional strategies/ notes

- Use of dictionary and other sources to acquire understanding.
- Teach strategies for understanding words in context.
- Model comprehension strategy used to determine meaning of words in text

Pacing: Throughout 2-3 weeks

PD/ preparation

- Determine strategies for teaching vocabulary and language of the discipline and literacy practices in reading and composition.
- Determine what the "language of the discipline" relevant to this task will be.
- 3. **Note-taking:** Ability to read purposefully and select relevant information; to summarize and/or paraphrase. #1 Mini-task
 - Prompt: Use Cornell Note-taking method (double entry journal), to identify evidence relative to the essential question; include page number and paragraph; write reaction or reflection to the chosen quotes or paraphrases
 - Product: Double entry journal
 - Mini-task scoring guide

	Meets	Not yet
•	Identifies appropriate quotes or paraphrases relevant to the	Attempts to meet the criteria
	essential question, includes personal reaction to text	for "meets"
•	Writes in readable prose.	

Instructional strategies/ notes

- Provide students with a note taking method(s) and template.
- Teach strategies for identifying and selecting source material in the form of quotes, passages, data, etc. as
 it relates to a controlling idea and task give students strategies for avoiding "highlight sprawl.
- Teach strategies for summarizing or paraphrasing.

Pacing Throughout 2-3 weeks

PD/ preparation

- Strategies for teaching note taking skills, summarizing and paraphrasing.
- http://www.montgomerycollege.edu/Departments/enreadtp/Cornell.html

#2 Mini-task

- Prompt: Use Post-It note strategy, write questions, thoughts you have about the book
- Product: Post-It notes stuck all throughout the book
- Mini-task scoring guide

1100 /00

 Asks appropriate and adequate amount of questions relevant to 	Attempts to meet the criteria
the essential question, includes personal reaction to text	for "meets"

Instructional strategies/ notes

- Provide students with a note taking method(s) and template.
- Teach strategies for questioning.
- Students will write questions as they read that they have about the text
- Students will write thoughts or reflections about text

Pacing 2-3 weeks

PD/ preparation

- Reading strategies asking questions, using Post-It notes to document questions on appropriate pages
- http://www.post-itteachers.com/index.php/tag/questioning-strategy/
- 4. **Organizing notes:** Ability to prioritize and narrow supporting information.

Mini-task

- Prompt: Review the notes you took and organize them to help you answer the essential question
- Product: Notes and graphic organizer
- Mini-task scoring guide

Meets	Not yet
Provides a prioritized set of notes that connect points for logic structure or line of thought.	Attempts to meet the criteria for "meets"
Suggests implications drawn from information about the issue or topic.	
Writes in readable prose.	

Instructional strategies/ notes

• Students prioritize notes from "most important" to "least important" or "most relevant" to "least relevant."

Pacing I day

PD/ preparation

 Strategies for developing cognitive strategies as well as practical ones for prioritizing ideas, supporting evidence.

Skills Cluster 3: Transition to Writing

1. **Bridging Conversation:** Ability to transition from reading or researching phase to the writing phase.

Mini-task

- Prompt: Complete a Reader's Response Journal friendly letter for their text by responding to the questions posed
- Product: Friendly letter with teacher/student dialogue
- Mini-task scoring guide: RRJ Rubric

Instructional strategies/ notes

• Student write in RRJ and teacher responds back and students respond back

- Questions for Reader's Response Journal entry What choice(s) did the character have to face? What were the consequences of those choices? Would you have made the same choice?
- Teacher will respond back to student in letter format with questions to move student comprehension to next level according to RRJ rubric (created by Goddard School)

Pacing: 3 days

PD/ preparation

Skills Cluster 4: Writing Process

. **Initiation of task:** Ability to establish a controlling idea and consolidate information relevant to task.

Mini-task

- Prompt: Using your notes organizer, complete the graphic organizer to determine your claim and evidence to support your position
- Product: Graphic organizer
- Mini-task scoring guide Teacher will conference with students to provide feedback around claim

- 1		
	Meets	Not yet
	Establish a reasonable claim and use evidence to support from text	Attempts to meet the criteria
	Writes in readable prose	for "meets"

Instructional strategies/ notes

• Discussion around "What is a claim?" and "What is evidence?"

Pacing: I day model and discuss, 2 days write and conference

PD/ preparation

- Exemplar should be created with students to ensure understanding of graphic organizer
- 2. **Planning:** Ability to develop a line of thought and text structure appropriate to an argumentation task.

Mini-task

- Prompt: Create an outline including key elements necessary to answer the essential question drawn from your reading (Identify choices and their subsequent consequences)
- Product: Outline/plan
- Mini-task scoring guide

	Meets	Not yet
•	Applies an outline strategy to develop reasoning for claim Provides citations and references with elements for correct form	Attempts to meet the criteria for "meets"
•	Draws a credible implication from information about an issue or topic	
•	Writes in readable prose	

Instructional strategies/ notes

- Model for students a completed outline create an exemplar with the students using <u>The Butterfly</u> by Patricia Pollacco
- Use mini-lessons in logic structures.

Pacing: 2 days

PD/ preparation

Teachers develop templates.

- PD in discussion-based strategies, questioning and logic structures.
- 3. **Development:** Ability to construct an initial draft with an emerging line of thought and structure.

Mini-task

- Prompt: Write an introductory paragraph that establishes the claim and provides a lead in for your reader.
 Write an initial draft to include multiple paragraphs: an opening, development of your process, an ending to include either a comment, conclusion, or implication
- Product: Introductory paragraph and first draft
- Mini-task scoring guide

Ī	Meets	Not yet
Ī	Provides an opening to include a controlling idea and an opening	Attempts to meet the criteria
	strategy relevant to the prompt	for "meets"
	• Provides an initial draft with all elements of the prompt addressed	
	Writes in readable prose	

Instructional strategies/ notes

- How to open and end an argumentation composition
- Use of template for all levels to guide students through first draft
- Student-led revision session

Pacing: 2-3 days

PD/ preparation

- Drafting strategies conferencing and whole group
- 4. **Revision:** Ability to apply revision strategies to refine development of argument, including line of thought, language usage, and tone as appropriate to audience and purpose

Mini-task

- *Prompt:* Self reflection revision read aloud your piece. Work with a partner to peer edit your pieces. Make revisions based on self reflection and peer feedback.
- Product: Revised drafts with feedback from peer
- Mini-task scoring guide

Meets		Not yet
•	Demonstrates use of revision strategies that clarify logic and	Attempts to meet the criteria
	development of ideas; embeds relevant details; improves word-	for "meets"
	usage and phrasing; and creates smooth transitions between sentences and paragraphs	
•	Applies a text structure to organize reading material content and	
	to explain key points related to the prompt	

Instructional strategies/ notes

- Teacher prepares peer editing checklist
- Peer feedback on clarity of thinking and development of claim/argument
- Strategies for embedding information citation methods, quoting, paraphrasing

Pacing: 2days

PD/ preparation

- Identify strategies for revising claim and evidence before editing grammar. Strategies such as individual & group mentoring; "what's good, what's needed" and peer feedback
- 5. **Editing:** Ability to apply editing strategies and presentation applications.

Mini-task

- Prompt: Finalize draft with finishing touches
- Product: Final draft
- Mini-task scoring guide

	8 8	
	Meets	Not yet
•	Demonstrates use of strategies that enhance the readability and	Attempts to meet the criteria
	appearance of the work for presentation	for "meets"

Instructional strategies/ notes

• Use of error analysis to encourage self-correction of language usage and grammatical errors

Pacing: 2 days

PD/ preparation

- Editing strategies
- · Technology and publishing methods

Final Draft: Submit your final draft before or on due date for scoring and feedback.

E. Materials, references and supports: List the materials you will need and students will use. Provide citations.

For Teachers	For Students
ELMO or overhead projector (optional) Chart paper	Texts "Thank you Ma'ma" "Passage to Freedom" On My Honor Marion Dane Bauer 750 The Skin I'm In Sharon Flake 670 Tuck Everlasting Natalie Babbit 770 The Butterfly Patricia Pollaco The Lady in the Box Ann McGovern 370 Breaking Point The Secret Soldier Ann McGovern 570 Multiply copies of novels Composition books Folders

Section 4: What Results?

How good is good enough?

- A. **Student work samples:** Include examples of student work to represent each performance level on the teaching task.
- B. Other scoring supports: To be determined as scoring work progresses.
- C. Classroom assessment task: Design a classroom assessment task using the same template task as the one you will be teaching. You may modify slightly the template to fit the in-class, on-demand environment. You should also include student examples for the assessment task.

Background:

Groups and individuals make choices on a daily basis. For example, citizens choose their lawmakers and students choose their friends; every choice carries a consequence. Through reading literature that highlights characters that have to make choices, students can analyze the consequences of those choices.

Prompt:

What are the consequences of choices that people make? After reading "Passages to Freedom", write an open response that addresses the question and support your position with evidence from the text.

	LDC Argumentation Classroom Assessment Rubric MEETS EXPECTATIONS	
Focus	Addresses the prompt and stays on task; provides a generally convincing response.	
Reading/Research	Demonstrates generally effective use of reading material to develop an argument.	
Controlling Idea	Establishes a credible claim and supports an argument that is logical and generally convincing. (L2) Acknowledges competing arguments while defending the claim.	
Development	Develops reasoning to support claim; provides evidence from text(s) in the form of examples or explanations relevant to the argument (L3) Makes a relevant connection(s) that supports argument.	
Organization	Applies an appropriate text structure that develops reasons.	
Conventions	Demonstrates a command of standard English conventions and cohesion; employs	
	language and tone appropriate to audience and purpose.	
NOT YET		
Focus	Attempts to address prompt but lacks focus or is off-task.	
Reading/Research	Demonstrates weak use of reading material to develop argument.	
Controlling Idea	Establishes a claim and attempts to support an argument but is not convincing;	
_	(L2) Attempts to acknowledge competing arguments.	
Development	Reasoning is not clear; examples or explanations are weak or irrelevant. (L3)	
-	Connection is weak or not relevant.	
Organization	Provides a weak text structure; composition is confusing.	
Conventions	Demonstrates a weak command of standard English conventions; lacks cohesion;	
	language and tone are not appropriate to audience and purpose.	

Teacher Work Section

What now, what next?

A.	Teacher thoughts. Provide thoughts and ideas after teaching the module to different students in different classes
B.	Possible variations. Add ideas for spin-offs or extensions to the module.